

Examining the Legislative Performance of Punjab Assembly (2013-2018): A Comprehensive Assessment of Quantitative and Qualitative Dimension

Nasir Iqbal

MPhil Scholar

*Department of Pakistan Studies
Govt. College University, Faisalabad*

Dr. Muhammad Waris

Associate Professor

GAC Shahpur Sadar, Sargodha

Dr. Amaria Atta

Department of Arts and Humanities

The Superior University, Faisalabad Campus

Abstract

The research aims to widely measure the legislative performance of the Punjab Assembly in the period of 2013 to 2018, by considering quantitative and qualitative dimensions. The Punjab Assembly, as the legislative body of the Punjab province in Pakistan, plays a decisive part in framing and executing policies, manufacturing laws, and in lieu of the interests of the citizens. The research employs a mixed-methods slant, uniting quantitative analysis of legislative outputs, for instance quantity of the bills passed, and qualitative scrutiny of the considered processes, legislative debates, and engagement with stakeholders. By examining both quantitative and qualitative dimensions, this study aims to offer all-inclusive considerate of the legislative performance and its effect on governance, egalitarianism, and public welfare. To accomplish this, primary data is placid through document examination of legislative records, as well as bills, minutes of the assembly sessions, various committee reports, and endorsed documents. The qualitative data is examined thematically, focusing on factors like efficiency of the legislation, depiction of diverse interests, transparency, and responsibility. The research results will subsidize to the standing literature on legislative

performance and provide insights for policymakers, legislators, and citizens. The study aims to recognize strengths and dimness in the legislative procedure and offer commendations for enhancing the practicality of the Punjab Assembly. The results can enlighten upcoming legislative reforms and fortify democratic governance in the Punjab province and elsewhere.

Keywords: Legislative performance, Punjab Assembly, Quantitative analysis, Qualitative valuation, Public wellbeing, Legislative reform.

Introduction:

In Pakistan's General elections on May 11, there were 577 competitions for general seats in the Provincial Assemblies of Balochistan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Punjab, and Sindh, and 272 contests for seats in the National Assembly in separate constituencies. The nation experienced different outcomes from these elections in various parts of the country. The nation's return to democracy, which started five years ago, was furthered with the 2013 elections, which were a crucial move. Despite efforts by extremists to sabotage the voting process, millions of Pakistanis showed their support for democracy by casting their ballots. According to the Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP), over 46 million Pakistanis used their right to vote in the elections, representing voting turnout of about 55. A victory of democracy and people of Pakistan, was achieved by the voters' bravery and determination to exercise right to vote despite the escalating violence. Several favorable factors contributed to the success of the 2013 General Elections, including a better legal environment, increased rivalry between parties and candidates, high voter participation and enthusiasm, and more efficient and independent election administration. However, given that political violence had a negative effect on the elections in several regions of the nation and that there were issues with election day procedures, women's political involvement, and the post-election atmosphere, more election reform efforts are required in a number of areas. The upcoming by-elections offer an immediate opportunity to enhance election administration and security in Pakistan, and the ensuing provincial local elections present additional chances for election reform.

Pakistan Muslim League (Nawaz) succeeded to form a government in the center as well as in the province of Punjab. In Punjab, PML-N was the only majority party with 248 general seats while the party won 58 women seats and 7 minority seats. Hence the total strength of the party in the Punjab Assembly was 313. The nearest competitor was Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf that has managed to win 24 general hearts while 5 women and 1 minority seat were also allocated to the party. Hence PTI managed to win 30 seats nearly one-tenth of PML-N.

Research Questions:

- 1) What was the inclusive legislative efficiency of the Punjab Assembly in the period of 2013-2018, and how does it relate to former years?
- 2) To what extent did the Punjab Assembly stick to to parliamentary customs and measures in terms of quorum, and contribution of the members during the period of 2013-2018?
- 3) What was the excellence and penetration of debates in the Punjab Assembly in the given period, and how did it work to the devising of legislation and dogma decisions?
- 4) How responsive was the Punjab Assembly to public opinion in terms of integrating citizen participation, speaking about grievances, and reflecting the public comforts in the legislative process?
- 5) What was gender participation ratio in the Punjab Assembly in the passé of 2013-2018, and how did it effect the inclusive legislative performance?
- 6) What were the major challenges Punjab Assembly faced in the completion of its legislative errands during 2013-2018, and what commendations can be made for the enhancement?

Quantitative Analysis of the Punjab Assembly (2013-2018)

The PML-N government did a tremendous job at the federal level in terms of legislation which included the amendments to the constitution and legislation related to the merger of FATA with Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Electoral Reform, human rights, drafting and printing laws, reach to info, economy and justice

system. The Punjab Assembly under PML-N also marked the same pace in terms of legislation. In this section, the quantitative performance of the Punjab Assembly during 2013-2018 is presented.

Number of Sessions, Sittings and Hours

The Punjab Assembly established after General election-2013 and completed its term in 2018. During these five years the Punjab Assembly held 36 sessions. In the first parliamentary year, the provincial Assembly held 8 sessions, 70 sittings and 100 working days. The proceedings time during first parliamentary years was a total of 215 hours. The second parliamentary year witnessed a decline in number of sessions where only 6 sessions were held in the provincial Assembly while 62 sittings over 101 days were held. Punjab Assembly in the next three parliamentary years witnessed 7, 8 and 7 sessions respectively. The Assembly business was stretched over 75, 73, and 72 sittings respectively while number of working days were increased in the last year i-e 106.¹ Moreover, the average delay in every session was from 71 to 82 minutes with most delaying time was in fourth parliamentary year. Average attendance of the members of provincial Assembly was above 70 except the second parliamentary year where average attendance was quite short i-e 28.²

Resolutions

The house used the "Resolution" method to express opinion, make suggestions, and communicate a message regarding a matter of public interest. The Punjab Assembly adopted a total of 217 resolutions during five years tenure. The provincial Assembly adopted 48 in the first year while 51, 59, 43 and 32 resolutions in the last four years respectively.³ In addition to these, five Private Members' resolutions were pending, thirteen were dismissed because the appropriate lawmakers were not present, and five were not brought up by the House. Up to 34 of the resolutions that were adopted had private sponsors, while 25 had treasury support, including 17 resolutions that asked for the term of ordinances to be extended.⁴ The resolutions passed by the House can be categorized as following: *Condemnation:*

Calling Attentions Notices (CANs)

For the purpose of drawing the attention of the government to a particular matter the method of CANs is used in the house. The Punjab Assembly during 2013-2018, 1035 CANs were issued while the house admitted only 630 of these. The number of CANs which were answered during these five years were 144.⁵

Questions

Every member of a democratic government, particularly ministers, must account to the legislature. Ministers are in charge of their departments and respond to questions posed by lawmakers. The first hour of each sitting is set aside for queries whenever the Punjab Assembly begins its session. The three question categories in the parliament are supplementary, unstarred, and starred. During question and answer period, replies to starred questions with are read aloud by ministers while un-starred questions only receive written responses. The follow-up questions in the supplemental questions are associated with the starred questions. In Punjab Assembly during (2013-2018), 6301 starred questions were asked while out of these 3952 questions were admitted in the house. The ministers responded to only 2037 questions while the remaining questions were unattended.⁶

Starred Questions

On the other hand, total number of un-starred questions that were asked in Punjab Assembly were 1459. Out of these 868 questions were admitted to the house while answered questions were 423.⁷

Privilege and Adjourned Motions

A privileged motion is one that is given priority over routine business because it deals with urgent or significant issues. Such resolutions are not subject to debate, though the chair may feel compelled to ask members for pertinent information if there are any privilege issues.⁸ In Punjab Assembly total 200 notices were issued on privilege motions. Out of these 87 were admitted to the house and only 71 were referred to the committees.⁹

Privilege Motions

Adjournment Motions

An adjournment motion's main goal is to bring the House's attention to a recent issue of urgent public significance that

could have serious repercussions and for which a motion or resolution with adequate notice would be out of the question. During PML-N government in Punjab total 1787 notices were issued on adjournment motions while 497 were admitted to the house. Moreover 861 adjournment motions were disposed of.¹⁰

Adjournment Motions

Legislation

Legislation is the most important job of the parliament throughout the world. People elect their representatives through vote and send them to the parliament for enacting laws. Punjab Assembly during 2013-2018, made a fine job in this regard. Both, government and private members' bills were introduced in these five years. Total 210 government bills were introduced in the house while 181 were passed.¹¹ 12 Private members' bills were introduced in the house and out of these only two bills became Act.¹²

Qualitative Aspect of legislation in Punjab Assembly (2013-2018)

PML-N came out as victorious in the general elections of 2013. The party succeeded to form governments in the center and in Punjab as well. In Punjab Assembly, the PML-N with 248 general seats was the only major political party. The nearest rival political party was PTI with only 30 seats in the Assembly. Mian Shahbaz Sharif became the Chief Minister, and the journey of Punjab assembly witnessed variety of valuable legislation during these five years. The first session was called on 2nd June, 2013 while the last session of the house was held on May 17th, 2018. The house legislated extensively in the fields of higher education in the province, primary education, free education, women protection from abuse, local government, healthcare and environment. Quantitative performance of the Punjab Assembly has been discussed in detail in the previous section. This section will examine the performance of Punjab Assembly qualitatively.

- **Higher Education**

The role of education in understanding the vision of beginning a knowledge-based economy is of paramount significance. Moreover, it plays a pivotal role in getting the social objectives of humanity, promotion communities, and humanizing individuals of veracity. Furthermore, education holds

tremendous importance for public welfare by facilitating the comprehension of cultural values, norms, and national interests, thereby empowering individuals to serve humanity more effectively. Historically, education has been regarded as a public good, benefiting not only the recipients of education but also the entire community due to its substantial and wide-ranging outcomes. This point of view on higher education has been the distinguished school of thought about its functions and position as a public good, and in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, it was regarded as a fundamental human right. The Punjab Higher Education Commission Bill 2014 was approved by the Punjab Assembly with the goal of enhancing and promoting higher education, study, and development in the province.¹³ A Punjab Higher Education Commission will be established under the new law, with the chief minister serving as the appointing authority. The PHEC bill that was passed asked for the creation of the commission, whose chairperson would be chosen by the CM. The commission's chairperson would serve a four-year period and would not be permitted to serve more than two terms. Along with a nomination from the FHEC, the 17-member committee would consist of secretaries from the departments of higher education, agriculture, health, and finance.¹⁴ Three vice chancellors, among them one of whom was from a private institution, should be members of the commission and must be appointed by the governor.¹⁵ The purpose of the PHEC was to raise the standards of provincial higher education institutions to parity with both international and national norms. Additionally, it would work in close coordination with the government HEC to achieve its goals. In accordance with the guidelines created by the federal HEC, it would develop and suggest policies for the management of higher education schools in the province. Additionally, it would oversee, assess, and provide guidance on issues pertaining to the institutions' success and quality improvement.¹⁶ Apart from establishing the higher education authority, the Punjab Assembly paid special attention to the establishment of universities across the province. The Assembly during these five years established 20 universities under the various Acts.¹⁷

- **Legislation related to women**

Women are nearly half of the population of Pakistan. Unfortunately, they are considered as of lesser status in the society. Punjab Assembly during its five years' tenure, passed several laws relating to women. These laws are included , “Punjab Women Protection Authority Bill 2017 , The Punjab Commission On The Status Of Women (Amendment) Bill 2015, The Punjab Protection Of Women Against Violence Bill 2015, The Punjab Fair Representation of Women Bill 2014, The Punjab Commission on the Status of Women Bill 2013, and The Punjab Workmen’s Compensation (Amendment) Bill 2013”. Out of these two legislations, the most important one was the protection of women against violence Bill that was passed in 2015. Women in Pakistan's patriarchal culture frequently experience physical, mental, and psychological abuse both at work and at home. It was the most comprehensive piece of legislation ever passed in Pakistan, and it seeks to give victims of violence, justice by creating and institutionalizing systems that protect them from all types of crimes involving violence against women. It is the first piece of law in Pakistani history to have its own means of implementation, known as Violence Against Women Centers (VAWCs).¹⁸ With the pilot project, VAWC to be created in Multan in March 2017, these Centers would be established through a phased program. According to the Act, all wrongs done to women are now crimes, including domestic violence, sexual assault, economic abuse, psychological abuse, stalking, and hacking. In addition to the already existing criminal ones, it also offers victims, civil remedies. These include residence orders, monetary orders, and protection orders. As a result, if the aggrieved party so chooses, she may begin parallel criminal procedures for VAW offences that are already prohibited by the Pakistan Penal Code and other current laws.¹⁹

Legislation Related to Local Government

The Concept of local government and democracy are interconnected as local government, in modern world are considered as the third tier. Pakistan since inception, exercised several models of local government system. The country witnessed the local government system during military governments till 2008. the issues of “division of power and resources” restrained the

civilian governments from adopting this governance model till 2008. However, the 18th amendment in the constitution transformed the “centralist” tendency of the state into “provincialism”. Resultantly many subjects shifted from federation to provinces. Local government was one such subject. On the instructions of Supreme Court of Pakistan every province implemented the local government system. Baluchistan was quick to implement the system in 2010, while other three provinces implemented the system in 2013. Punjab Assembly passed “Punjab Local Government Act” in 2013 and was followed by several amendment bills in the following years.²⁰ It was the first ever legislation on the subject during civilian rule in the province and it was the main reason that the legislation represented the centralist tendencies instead of devolution.²¹ The Act was composed of 20 chapters and each chapter discussed various details of the local government. Majority of the scholars agreed that Musharraf’s devolution of power Act was one of the best systems of local government in Pakistan. The PLGA (2013) was quite opposite to the previous system. The rural-urban divide was once again introduced in the Act. The whole province was divided into Metropolitan Corporation, District Council, Municipal Corporation, Municipal Committees and Union Councils.²² In the previous system the power was transferred to elected representatives while in this system, the power was again handed over to bureaucracy as Deputy Commissioners had immense powers.²³ Moreover, the financial powers were also not given to the local bodies instead kept with the provincial government. The most controversial aspect of the Bill was the introduction of indirect elections as majority of layers in the PLGA (2013) were indirectly elected instead of direct election. These were the flaws due to which the Act amended several times during the Punjab Assembly’s term of 2013-2018, and finally in 2019 a new system of local government was introduced by PTI government.

Legislation about Child Protection

Child abuse, child marriage and child labor are challenges which every developing country is facing in the world today. Pakistan is also a developing country and facing the same crises in the country. Punjab is the largest province of the country in

terms of population. In past several attempts were made to prohibit such practices however; those attempts were failed. Punjab Assembly passed several Acts related to Child marriage, child labor, and child abuse during its tenure of 2013-2018 like The Child Marriage Restraint (Amendment) Bill 2015, The Punjab Prohibition of Child Labour At Brick Kilns Bill 2016, The Punjab Restriction on Employment Of Children Bill 2016, and The Punjab Destitute and Neglected Children (Amendment) Bill 2017.²⁴

Two regulations were passed by the Punjabi government in 2016 to end child labor in the province. One was industry-specific, while the other was all-encompassing and thus relevant to all industries. The Punjab Prohibition of Child Labor at Brick Kilns Act 2016, which was first published in January 2016 as an Ordinance, outlaws the employment of kids younger than 14 in brick kilns.²⁵ Children (under the age of 15) are not allowed to work in any type of business, according to the Punjab Restriction on Employment of Children Act 2016, which was first enacted as an Ordinance in July 2016. The employment of teenagers (those under the age of 18) in any dangerous job (there are 38 hazardous jobs listed in this Act) is also restricted. Both Acts show the Punjab Government's effort and commitment to combating the problem of child labor.

The Punjab Destitute and Neglected Children (Amendment) Bill 2017 was passed by the provincial assembly, and it resulted in the creation of another legislation. "If a person hires a child for begging or causes a child to beg or, having the custody, charge, or care of a child, conspires at or encourages employment of the child for begging or uses a child, conspires at or encourage employment of the child for begging, he is liable with imprisonment for a term that may extend to five years but which shall not be less than three months and with fine that may not be less than one thousand dollars," states Section 36 of the Bill.²⁶

- **Legislation About Healthcare**

As we all know, the greatest wealth is our health. Sound health is central to human happiness and welfare. It also contributes to financial growth, as healthy people live longer, exhibit progressive brilliance and productivity for their country. To address the issue in this area, Punjab Assembly enacted laws to

safeguard the health of its inhabitants. The Assembly passed the legislations like The Pakistan Kidney and Liver Institute and Research Center Act 2014, The Punjab Reproductive, Maternal, Neo-natal and Child Health Authority Bill 2014, The Punjab Mental Health (Amendment) Bill 2014.²⁷

The creation of the Kidney and Liver Institute was the most significant of these Acts. A startling number of renal and liver diseases are present in Pakistan, a nation plagued by extreme poverty and neglected healthcare systems. The range encompasses illnesses, such as Hepatitis, that lead to both acute and chronic kidney and liver diseases, as well as kidney conditions that arise in the presence of pre-existing liver disease.²⁸ Nearly 10 million people have Hepatitis C, more than 5 million have Hepatitis B, and about 70% of these people reside in the Punjab region. This indicates that 1 in every 12 people in Pakistan has this illness. The prevalence of Hepatitis B and C in the nation has exploded in recent years. Only a small number of hospitals in Pakistan are sufficiently specialized to address the difficulty that kidney, liver, and bladder issues account for about 40% of diseases.

In these conditions, there was a clear need for a facility that specializes in kidney and liver care. As a result, the Punjab Assembly approved the Pakistan Kidney and Liver Institute Act 2014, which established the PKLI&RC. A self-governing council made up of experts with the highest levels of professional integrity oversees PKLI&RC's operations. Additionally, by bringing together scientists and clinicians from around the world on one platform for cutting-edge research, PKLI&RC is fostering the culture of research. At the liver and kidney institute, the Institutional Review Board evaluates each study project. On a range of scientific topics, PKLI&RC has been collaborating closely with the University of the Punjab's Center of Excellence in Molecular Biology (CEMB), a renowned study facility.²⁹

- **Legislation About Right to Information**

To encourage accountability in the operation of government agencies, the Punjab Transparency and Right to Information Act, 2013, was passed in 2013. The legislation was passed to increase public information access and increase government accountability to the people. The fundamental rights enshrined

in Article 19 A of the Constitution, which was added via the 18th Amendment in 2010, are the foundation of the Punjab Transparency and Right to Information Act, 2013, which was passed in 2013.

- **Legislation About Environment**

The Pakistan Environmental Protection Act, 1997, was amended by the Punjab Environmental Protection (Amendment) Act 2017, in 2017. It encompasses the entire Punjab province. Environment was made a provincial subject as a result of the devolution of powers to the provinces, and as a result, the acts address matters related to and incidental to environmental protection, conservation, rehabilitation, and improvement, pollution prevention and control, and promotion of sustainable development. In light of Pakistan Environmental Protection Act, 1997, the act must be read.³⁰ After the bill was introduced to the assembly, PML-Q MPA Khadeeja Umar raised serious concerns about the bill during a point of order and bemoaned the government's failure to adequately address the environment problem. She gave a passionate speech on the environmental issues the city was facing, and both the opposition and the treasury benches gave her a thunderous round of ovation. The 2017 Environment Protection (Amendment) Bill is nothing more than eyewash. The bill's changes to the director general's powers are merely clerical in nature. The environmental issues in Lahore will not be resolved by this law.

- **Legislation About Education**

The Punjab Free and Compulsory Education Ordinance 2014 was passed by the Punjab government in response to its acceptance of responsibility for ensuring that all children in the province between the ages of 5 and 16 have the right to an education. In order to execute Article 25-A, which was added to the Constitution in 2010 and requires the state to provide free and compulsory education to children aged 5 to 16, Punjab Governor Chaudhry Muhammad Sarwar issued the ordinance. The Punjabi government has been mandated by law to provide children with free and mandatory schooling since 2010. As the Punjab Assembly was not in session and the governor was satisfied that the current situation necessitated taking action, he promulgated the ordinance. The Punjab Compulsory Primary

Education Act of 1994 has been repealed by the decree, which also stipulates that all similar laws must be brought into compliance with its goals and structure within five years. Every child has a right to free, compulsory education from Grades I through X, non-formal education, vocational education, or a combination of all three, taking into account their needs, abilities, and age, in order to guarantee they complete their education. According to this, neither a kid nor a parent is required to pay any tuition, fees, or other costs to attend a school run by the local or national government. The ordinance aims to create the necessary number of schools by creating local authorities (local government, an autonomous or statutory government entity exercising administrative control over a school). It will also come up with a plan for using the institutions after-hours. According to the ordinance, the federal and municipal governments must develop a system of grants-in-aid to promote enrollment and support attendance of a disadvantaged child.

Conclusion

The provincial Assemblies' authority and duties are covered in Parts IV and V of the constitution. Provincial legislatures are covered by Articles 101 to 159. The governor's duties and responsibilities are covered in Chapter 1 of Part IV. According to Article 101 of the constitution, the President, on the recommendation of the Prime Minister, is responsible for selecting governors. Furthermore, it is stated that the governor will retain the position until the president so pleases. According to Article 104 of the constitution, the speaker of the provincial legislature will serve as the governor's replacement. Additionally, the governor must follow the recommendations of the provincial council. The number of seats in every province is mentioned in the Article 106 of the constitution. The provincial assembly of Punjab is allocated 297 general seats while, 66 seats for women and 8 seats for minorities. Articles 106-130 describes the powers of Provincial Assembly of Punjab in terms of legislation. According to the constitution, provincial legislatures are responsible to the following under the Constitution:

- Provincial Assembly is responsible for electing the Chief Minister, Speaker, and Deputy Speaker.

- The provincial Assemblies play the role of electoral college for the election of President and Senator from respective provinces.
- Any issue that is not included in the Federal Legislative List, including criminal law, criminal process, evidence, and other matters, may be enacted by the provincial assembly as laws for the province.
- it is prohibited from passing legislation that is in conflict with the prohibitions of Islam as outlined in the Holy Quran and the Sunnah, with any clause of the Constitution, with a federal law, with any fundamental right, or with the Principles of Policy.
- Financial responsibility, such as approving the provinces' annual and supplemental budgets and legislating spending.
- Taking Charge of Administration.

As a result of the 18th amendment, provinces now have the ability and freedom to create local government structures and delegate political, administrative, and financial authority to elected officials. Additionally, it gave the provinces more financial and administrative authority.

The legislation process is almost same in Provincial Assemblies and National Assembly of Pakistan. The first step is the introduction of Bill in the Assembly. There are two types of Bills presented in the house i-e Government Bill and Private Member Bill. Government Bills are those proposed laws which is presented by Ministers while Private Member bills are those pieces of legislations that are presented by those members who are not part of cabinet. Punjab Assembly, had introduced 210 Bills during these five years and passed 181 while rejected 6 bills. The remaining bills were pending and considered in the next tenure of the house. Legislation rate was about 86% during this tenure which is quite good.

Three aspects of non-legislative business were alarming and raised serious questions over the seriousness of our legislators in the Punjab Assembly. The first aspect was nearly 30% of working days in these five years. The average working days during which legislators attended the house, were 100 which is not satisfactory to any standard. The second aspect was the related to attendance of the members of the house. The total

strength of Punjab Assembly is 372 while it was observed that the average attendance of members was about 80-85 in every sitting that makes roughly 20-24%. This shows the less interests of legislators in their main job i-e legislation. The last alarming aspect was the question-answer session. First hour of any sitting is usually reserved for questions. Questions are asked from relevant ministers and can be asked by any member of the house whether government or opposition. Ministers are bound to satisfy the queries of members of the house. However, the data shown in the above table, revealed quite disturbing trend. Nearly 20% questions were answered by the ministers during these five years which solely against the spirit of democracy. In sum we can say that in terms of legislative business the house performed well while in terms of non-legislative business the performance of the house was not up to the mark.

The Qualitative analysis of the legislation in Punjab Assembly during 2013-2018 shows that government of Punjab performed quite well in social and educational sector. Punjab Assembly performed extra ordinarily in the field of education both higher education and primary education. The government legislated extensively for the betterment of higher education in the province. Universities are considered the basic units for imparting higher education in any society. Pakistan is a country where higher education remained the focus of government in the last two decades. Universities in various parts of country were established, however Punjab Assembly's legislation regarding the establishing of universities were remarkable. Nearly 20 universities were established in the whole province which is a great achievement according to any standard. Furthermore, free schooling to children up to the age of 16 years was another master piece of the Punjab assembly during this tenure. Summarily we can say that Punjab Assembly paid full attention to social and educational, local government sector however ignored the most important field i-e institutional reforms. Strong institutions are the strength of any democratic system

References

- ¹ Provincial Assembly of Punjab, *Provincial Assembly of Punjab* (Government of Punjab, 2018), last modified 2018, accessed December 12, 2022, https://www.pap.gov.pk/assembly_business/consolidated/en/20?filter=true..
- ² FAFEN, *Annual Performance Appraisal of the Punjab Assembly* (Islamabad: FAFEN, 2018).
- ³ Provincial Assembly of Punjab, *Resolutions (2013-2018)* (Lahore: Punjab Government, 2018).
- ⁴ FAFEN, *Annual Performance Appraisal of the Punjab Assembly*, 2018.
- ⁵ Provincial Assembly of Punjab, "Calling Attention Notices," *Provincial Assembly of Punjab* (Punjab Government, 2018), last modified 2018, accessed January 10, 2023, https://www.pap.gov.pk/assembly_business/question_performance/en/20?filter=true.
- ⁶ Provincial Assembly of Punjab, "Questions," *Provincial Assembly of Punjab* (Government of Punjab, 2018), last modified 2018, accessed January 12, 2023, https://www.pap.gov.pk/assembly_business/question_performance/en/20?filter=true.
- ⁷ Ibid.
- ⁸ Robert Henry M III, *Robert's Rules of Order.*, 11th ed. (Philadelphia: De Capo Press, 2020), 27.
- ⁹ Provincial Assembly of Punjab, "Privilege Motions," *Provincial Assembly of Punjab* (Government of Punjab, 2018), last modified 2018, accessed December 8, 2022, https://www.pap.gov.pk/assembly_business/motion_performance/en/20?filter=true.
- ¹⁰ Ibid.
- ¹¹ Provincial Assembly of Punjab, "Bills," *Provincial Assembly of Punjab* (Government of Punjab, 2018), last modified 2018, accessed November 23, 2022, https://www.pap.gov.pk/bills/show/en/20/passed?filter=true&bill_type=government&committee_id=0.
- ¹² Provincial Assembly of Punjab, "Private Member Bills," *Provincial Assembly of Punjab* (Government of Punjab, 2018), last modified 2018, accessed November 24, 2022, https://www.pap.gov.pk/bills/show/en/20/passed?filter=true&bill_type=private&committee_id=0.
- ¹³ Aroosa Shaukat, "Punjab Assembly: Bill Passed to Lift Standards of Higher Education," *The Express Tribune*, December 29, 2014.
- ¹⁴ Ibid.
- ¹⁵ Ibid.
- ¹⁶ Ibid.

- ¹⁷ Provincial Assembly of Punjab, “Bills,” *Provincial Assembly of Punjab* (Government of Punjab, 2018), last modified 2018, accessed November 23, 2022, https://www.pap.gov.pk/bills/show/en/20/passed?filter=true&bill_type=government&committee_id=0.
- ¹⁸ Salman Sufi, *Punjab Protection of Women against Violence ACT, 2016* (Lahore: Strategic Reform Unit, 2020).
- ¹⁹ Ibid.
- ²⁰ Abdul Manan, “Punjab Assembly: Local Govt Bill Passed with Majority,” *The Express Tribune*, August 21, 2013.
- ²¹ Hasaan Khawar, “Local Governments in Punjab: For Better or Worse,” *The Express Tribune*, September 19, 2019.
- ²² See Chapter II, Section 6, PLGA (2013).
- ²³ Amjad Nazeer, *Punjab Local Government ACT 2013 (a Critical Analysis)* (Islamabad: Institute of Development Research and Corresponding Capabilities, September 2013).
- ²⁴ Provincial Assembly of Punjab, “Bills,” *Provincial Assembly of Punjab* (Government of Punjab, 2018), last modified 2018, accessed November 23, 2022, https://www.pap.gov.pk/bills/show/en/20/passed?filter=true&bill_type=government&committee_id=0.
- ²⁵ Itikhar Ahmad, “Eradicating Child Labour in Punjab,” *Paycheck.pk* (WageIndicator Foundation, n.d.), accessed November 21, 2022, <https://paycheck.pk/labour-laws/fair-treatment/minors-and-youth/legislative-and-institutional-reforms-on-child-labour>.
- ²⁶ Rana Yasif, “Punjab Assembly Passes Bill against Child Begging,” *The Express Tribune*, September 21, 2017.
- ²⁷ Provincial Assembly of Punjab, “Bills,” *Provincial Assembly of Punjab* (Government of Punjab, 2018), last modified 2018, accessed November 23, 2022, https://www.pap.gov.pk/bills/show/en/20/passed?filter=true&bill_type=government&committee_id=0.
- ²⁸ Muhammad Ali Sajjad, “Review of Pakistan Kidney & Liver Institute and Research Center,” *Daily Times*, May 28, 2019.
- ²⁹ Ibid.
- ³⁰ Khalid Zafar, *The Punjab Environment Protection (Amendment) Act, 2017* (Lahore: Khalid Zafar & Associates, 2017).